

Building · Codes · Planning 601 East Main Street 423.434.6047

Historic Zoning Commission Meeting Minutes August 27, 2019

The Historic Zoning Commission held their regularly scheduled meeting on August 27, 2019 at 5:30 pm in the Commission Chambers of the Municipal and Safety Building.

Members Present: Col. Paul Williamson, Vice-Chairman and Planning

Commission Representative

Mr. Wesley Forsythe Dr. Harold (Hal) Hunter

Ms. Valda Jones

Members Absent: Mr. Nathan Brand, Chairman

Ms. Liz Biosca Mr. Tom Mozen

Staff Present: Matthew Manley, AICP, Senior Planner

Preston Mitchell, Director of Development Services

Nicole Lawrence, Recording Secretary, City of Johnson City

Vice-Chairman Williamson called the meeting to order at 5:30 p.m. A quorum was present.

Approval of the Johnson City Historic Zoning Commission agenda was put forth. A motion to approve was put forth by Commissioner Jones with a second from Commissioner Forsythe. The agenda was approved 4-0.

The minutes from the Historic Zoning Commission Emergency Called Meeting held on August 13, 2019 were approved 4-0.

The minutes from the Historic Zoning Commission Meeting held on July 23, 2019 were approved 4-0.

Reporting Committees

<u>Blight Taskforce</u>: Will meet September 11, 2019 at 12:00 pm in the Administrative Conference Room. This will be the second official meeting of the taskforce with many issues to discuss.

<u>Downtown Design Committee:</u> Met in early August, Discussed the façade Grant and the Breezeway issues. That project is on hold until a final decision is made by the city on the materials they wish to use on the wall. The design of the Breezeway includes planters, outdoor seating and lighting. The JCDA are funding all improvements.

<u>Design Review Committee</u>: Disused 104 Tipton St. This will be further discussed in the meeting this evening.

Staff approved CoA's

CoA for 107 W. Pine St. approved a new porch with the same materials.

<u>Enforcement Update</u>: 416 and 423 W Maple are under contract with an investor for rehabilitation but they have not closed on the homes and there is no further progress as of this evening.

1888 Building - The owners are close to having a contract with Earnest Campbell for the rehabilitation and construction of the outside of this building.

<u>120 Buffalo St.-</u> Vacant building and this may be in the process of selling.

Upcoming Initiatives

- Preservation of certain structures in the West Walnut District.
- Protocol for excavating historic materials (old street bricks, trolley lines, etc.)
- Major Water / Sewer Project planned for Downtown.
- Historic Markers for Powell Square Park & old Science Hill High School football field (Memorial Park).
 - Primary sources needed
 - Volunteers interested in researching?

New Business

CoA 231-2019 420 W. Pine St. - Chimney Demolition

Originally, the house had two chimneys. Prior owners removed the chimney for the Living Room. The second chimney goes to a fireplace that was encapsulated in an interior wall.

Mortar joints are deteriorating causing the bricks of the non-functioning chimney to become loose making the entire chimney unsafe.

The flashing around the chimney has become separated from the house [and] has led to leaks.

The chimney has a lean to left if you are facing the house.

Want to remove the chimney as it serves no purpose and patch the hole in the roof once the chimney is removed and place shingles.

While the chimney is very visible from the street, it is an interior chimney and not as prominent as a chimney that is part of an exterior wall. That said, this structure and its chimneys were built in 1916. The house (and its elements) are contributing to the Tree Streets Historic District and National Register District. Chimneys are critical elements of the structures within the historic district and every effort should be made to preserve elements which contribute to the character and importance of the District. The status of the deteriorating mortar joints came from a roofing specialist. Staff advised the petitioner to get a second opinion from an expert in historic masonry to determine if the chimney could be salvaged. That opinion was not submitted with the original application in January 2019. However, an opinion has been submitted by Met-Co Systems which states: "Chimney is decayed beyond safe repair"

The public hearing was opened; <u>Perry Hodge 1013 Grace Dr. Johnson City, Tn.</u> - The applicant spoke in favor of the chimney demolition.

Seeing no one else wished to speak, the public hearing was closed.

Commissioner Mozen, the board Architect, who is not present this evening sent in formal comments to Mr. Manley regarding his opinion on the removal of this chimney. He did not feel the removal would leave a negative impact on this home. The chimney is decayed and a fire hazard at this time.

A motion to approve as presented was put forth by Commissioner Hunter with a second from Commissioner Forsythe.

Motion approved as presented.

VOTE: 4-0

CoA 270-2019 - 104 Tipton St. - New Building

This is a proposal for a new 2-story building at the corner of Tipton St and Buffalo St. The proposed building would be 26'x102' and 30' tall with a double porch on the side that is 15' x 52'. See attached renderings.

From historical photos and field observations, we can see that a two-story building once sat at this location. At some point that building was removed and the Coca-Cola sign was painted on the adjacent building. Then a 1-story

building was constructed at this site. That building also did not withstand the test of time and the lot has remained clear of any structures for a number of years. Last year, the City of Johnson City vacated a portion of its corner right-of-way adjacent to this location to make this project work. Exterior Renovations - In reviewing the proposal, staff has highlighted portions of the Downtown Design Guideline policies that staff believes are critical to the proposed project.

The proposed new construction meets the design guidelines as proposed. The building is unable to maintain the front building line for two reasons. 1) the parcel line for this parcel does not align with the others on the block, 2) a Fire Department Connection (FDC) was placed on the side of the adjacent building requiring the new building to be setback 5-6'. In order to offset this, the applicant is proposing an awning and outdoor seating area to satisfy the design guidelines. Second floor windows should be required to align with others on the block. Rear elevations have not been provided. Additional information on the screening of mechanical equipment is needed.

The public hearing was opened;

Michael Mansey 609 Franklin Sq. Ct. JC - Applicant spoke in favor of the proposal. He spoke with the city prior to buying the property from the city and decided to close the bottom portion of the building, this will be a restaurant. He feels this building will enhance the area. He stated he will be planting more shrubbery and landscaping, they want this to have a sitting in the park feel to the outdoor dining area and patio. He agrees to add as many tress as the city would like him too.

Seeing no one else wished to speak the public hearing was closed.

The Commissioners asked for the conditions presented by staff be attached to the motion for approval. All conditions may be brought before staff for approval. The conditions are as follows:

- Provide clarification of design (enclosure) of first floor side addition. If enclosed provide additional renderings and information on proposed materials.
- Provide additional information on the placement / screening of mechanical equipment.
- Give consideration to additional windows / alignment of horizontal elements on the proposed design of the façade facing State of Franklin including for rear of side addition.
- Give consideration for additional transparency on the first floor Buffalo St side.
- Provide additional detail regarding the landscaping plan

A motion to approve with conditions as presented was put forth by Commissioner Jones with a second from Commissioner Hunter. Motion approved as presented with conditions. VOTE: 4-0

Public Hearing for Hillrise Park / Gump Addition to be nominated for the National Register of Historic Places .

The Hillrise Park / "Gump Addition" neighborhood was initially platted in 1927 as the first landscaped residential subdivision in the Tri-Cities area. Construction slowed during the Great Depression and World War II. With the rest of the neighborhood being constructed after the war, the neighborhood provides an excellent cross section of architectural styles. The original landowner/developer was Harry D. Gump, which is why the area is affectionately referred to as the "Gump Addition". Prior to serving as a neighborhood, the land was the original grounds for the Johnson City Country Club.

Though it has been several years since the Historic Preservation Element was adopted (2004), with support from residents, a grant to fund the survey, inventory and national register nomination for Hillrise Park was sought by the City. The Development Services Department mailed individual letters to all residences within proximity to the Study Area in the fall of 2017. A public meeting was held in October 2017 where city staff, along with representatives from the Tennessee Historical Commission (THC), met with the 17 residents who attended. With their support, a grant application was submitted to the THC to fund a consultant to perform the work. The grant was awarded and a contract with the State was executed on October 1, 2018. The City has until October 1, 2019 to complete the project.

An RFP for these services was issued in January 2019. The City received 5 excellent proposals. A Selection Committee comprised of staff, HZC Commissioners and a neighborhood representative reviewed, scored and ranked the proposals. The Selection Committee unanimously agreed upon Thomason & Associates to perform the project.

Phil Thomason and his team began working to survey and inventory the study area throughout late winter / early spring of 2019. They presented their findings to approximately 50 residents at a public meeting on June 10 at Watauga Ave Presbyterian Church. At this point in the process it was determined that an additional 3 blocks should be included in the Study Area. The consultant agreed to add these properties to the nomination and Planning staff hosted an additional public meeting for these residents July 16. Six residents attended the second meeting.

The 79-page National Register of Historic Places nomination form includes a description of the area, a list and description of all the structures in the district, as well as maps and photographs documenting the properties. There are a total of 174 properties/structures included in the nomination. One Hundred and Forty Seven (147) of these are considered

"Contributing" while 26 are considered "Non-contributing". These numbers include 30 secondary structures (accessory dwellings and garages) that were also inventoried.

The public hearing was opened; Patricia Oldham- 908 E 9th Ave – Spoke in favor of the proposed nomination.

Seeing no one else wished to speak the public hearing was closed.

Commissioner Jones would like the original Sanborn Maps included in the nomination.

A motion to approve as presented was put forth by Commissioner Hunter with a second from Commissioner Jones.

Motion approved as presented. This will move forward to the City Commission as a Resolution for approval at their September 5, 2019 City Commission meeting.

VOTE: 4-0

CoA 2018-281 - 822 W. Locust to amend original request

- Removal of secondary gable is appropriate
- Alteration of stairs makes the stairs much more pronounced than is found elsewhere in the district.
- East Elevation continues to have reduced fenestration.
- Started off with 7 full windows and 2 side lights.
- Currently proposing 2 half windows and 2 full windows, no side lights.
- Additional roof line adds articulation

Despite the reduction of fenestration, the proposed changes are not detrimental to the overall project. The additional roofline on the East elevation alleviates the impact of the elimination of windows. The proposed modifications generally agree with the Design Guidelines. Staff recommends approval.

The public hearing was opened; <u>Richard Booth 822 W. Locust-</u> Applicant spoke in favor of the renovation and amended changes.

Seeing no one else wished to speak the public hearing was closed.

A motion to approve as presented was put forth by Commissioner Jones with a second from Commissioner Forsythe.

Motion approved as presented.

VOTE: 4-0

There being no other business, the meeting adjourned at 6:45 p.m.

Paul Williamson - Vice-Chairman